



City of Carmel

CARMEL PLAN COMMISSION SPECIAL STUDIES COMMITTEE JULY 6, 2004

Minutes

The regularly scheduled meeting of the Special Study Committee convened at 7:00 PM on July 6, 2004, in the Caucus Rooms of City Hall, Carmel, Indiana.

Members present: Jerry Chomanczuk; Wayne Haney; Mark Rattermann, and Steve Stromquist, thereby establishing a quorum.

DOCS Staff member Jon Dobosiewicz attended the meeting on behalf of the Department.

The Committee considered the following items:

1. Docket No. 04050037 ADLS Amend: Thrifty Car Sales-

The applicant seeks approval for a wall sign. The site is located at 3400 E 96th Street
The site is zoned B-3/Business.
Filed by Thrifty Car Sales.

TABLED

2. Docket No. 04040044 ADLS Amend: Enterprise Rent-A-Car

The applicant seeks approval for replacement wall and ground signage. The site is located at 931 N Range Line Rd. The site is zoned B-3/Business.
Filed by Thad Oldham for Enterprise Rent-A-Car.

Thad Oldham and Sean Lyons appeared before the Committee on behalf of the applicant.

The proposal is for a wall sign that will replace the existing, "Affordable Rent-A-Car" sign on the building and a ground sign. The petitioner would like a box sign for Enterprise for two reasons: illumination below the sign for security purposes, and for visual effect.

The petitioner would also like to make modifications to the existing ground sign. The "e" logo would be square and individual, green in color with white letters on a black background.

Department Report, Jon Dobosiewicz. The proposal for the ground sign conforms to the Ordinance and the Department's recommendation (Option #3.) The wall sign on the building is

different than earlier submitted. The Department prefers channel lettering that will provide consistency in the signage in the area.

The Enterprise property is owned by Bob Butler, Butler Toyota, and the sign meets with his approval as Ken Wycoff, the shop manager, and Bruce of Carmel Hot Tubs.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of Docket No. 04040044 ADLS Amend, Enterprise Rent-A-Car, subject to Option #3 as presented, and channel letters, seconded by Steve Stromquist, APPROVED 4-0.

3. Docket No. 04050004 ADLS Amend: Hilton Garden Inn

The applicant seeks approval for a ground sign. The site is located at 13090 N Pennsylvania Street. The site is zoned B-2/Business within the US Highway 31 Overlay Zone.

Filed by Tim Dora for Meridian Hotel Partners, LLC.

Tim Dora, Hilton Garden Inn, appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. A ground entry sign for Hilton Garden Inn is proposed on Pennsylvania Street. Brick will be used to match the brick in the building, accented with EFIS that matches EFIS on the building. Letters could be red, brass, or silver and illuminated by ground lights on each side. The sign would be closer to the 6-foot, overall height, perhaps 7 feet wide but under 60 square feet.

Mr. Dora said the word “Hilton” on the sign is smaller—down-played, and “Garden Inn” is larger—up-played. There is no logo on the sign. The building has illuminated channel letters in white; a variance was required from Hilton to do that (their standard is red.) The proposed sign is not illuminated channel letters—there is no neon behind it—it is a cutout letter mounted on the wall and illuminated with ground lights.

Department Report, Jon Dobosiewicz. The preference is for the sign materials as proposed, with silver, individual lettering. A cut-sheet for the lighting is requested to verify no light spillage. The Department would like to review the finished elevation later.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04050004 ADLS Amend, Hilton Garden Inn as proposed, subject to** a height limitation of 5 feet and silver letters, seconded by Steve Stromquist, APPROVED 4-0.

4. WITHDRAWN Docket No. 04040017 DP—Carmel Science and Technology Park, Blk 11, lot 4: Companion Animal Hospital (Development Plan)
~~The applicant seeks to construct a veterinarian office. The site is located just southwest of the intersection of Carmel Dr and Guilford Ave. The site is zoned M-3 District. Filed by Mark Monroe of Drewry, Simmons, Pitts & Vornehm for REI Investments.~~

5. Docket No. 04040041 DP/ADLS: Bauer Commercial Park- Tom Wood

The applicant proposes a automotive inventory parking lot. The site is located at the southeast corner of Bauer and Marie Drives. The site is zoned B-3/Business.

Filed by Larry Lawhead of Barnes & Thornburg.

Lawrence Lawhead, attorney with Barnes & Thornburg appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. The proposal is for an inventory parking area to receive cars—it is not a display area. The property is bounded by commercial real estate on all four sides.

The plan provides for a retention area that will actually improve drainage to the south. No signage is contemplated.

At public hearing, one of the neighbors spoke of test cars currently being driven through the neighborhood. Mr. Lawhead stated that the proposal is not for a dealership, there will be no customers on this lot, it is simply inventory parking and space to off-load cars. As cars are taken off the lot, they will be driven toward 96th Street, away from the residential area, and this should not be an issue. There is a stated policy—all general managers have instructed sales personnel not to drive into the residential area for test-drives.

The fencing is high-quality bonding, black vinyl in color. A sample of the fencing was displayed—(two inch gauge.) Mr. Lawhead was in favor of a smaller gauge. The fencing is 6 feet tall.

Dept. Report, Jon Dobosiewicz. The site plan shows the sidewalk along the street, pushed up to the back-side of the curb—the sidewalk should be on the back side of the right-of-way so that the grass strip will be between the sidewalk and the curb.

Mark Rattermann stated that there have been conversations with the car dealers along 96th Street regarding parking on the grass. Mr. Rattermann was very adamant—if cars are parked on the grass, the City will tow them!

Mark Rattermann made formal motion to forward Docket No. 04040041 DP/ADLS, Bauer Commercial Park-Tom Wood to the full Plan Commission with a positive recommendation, subject to sidewalk placement as indicated in the Department Report, seconded by Steve Stromquist, Approved 4-0.

6. Docket No. 04040040 DP/ADLS: Carmax, Lot 2 - Steak n Shake

The applicant proposes a restaurant with a drive-thru. The site is located on the northwest corner of 96th Street and Gray Rd. The site is zoned B-3/Business.
Filed by Mark Monroe of Drewry Simmons, Pitts & Vornehm.

Mark Monroe, attorney with Drewry Simmons, appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Also present: Michael Crowley, Associate General Counsel for Steak 'n Shake; Jake Kaiemeyer, senior construction project administrator, and Jamie Shinamen, project engineer, Weihe Engineers.

The subject site is located on the northwest corner of 96th Street and Gray Road. The Department Report references the traffic issue. The main access is on 96th Street and will be

S:\PlanCommission\Minutes\SpecialStudyCommitteeMinutes\SS2004jul06

right in/right out, and will not only provide access for Steak 'n Shake but the additional lot as well. This solution addresses traffic having to go all the way around the site and travel south. Mark Monroe reported that he had spoken with the City Engineer, and the median proposed would extend far enough north of the site that a "U-turn would be prevented.

The rooftop mechanical equipment will be screened from view and a rendering has been submitted to the Department addressing this situation.

There was a comment regarding proposed signage—the Steak 'n Shake symbol is in the form of a sign on the west façade of the building. The petitioner is agreeable to the design of the sign that adds a little "three-dimension." The petitioner will raise the flag or the circular part of the sign, and depress the letters.

The petitioner reported that all concerns of the TAC committee have been addressed.

Department Report, Jon Dobosiewicz. While the building maintains the Steak 'n Shake identity, it is a replication of a store that would be built in any other community. While there is no prescribed building style at this location, (such as one would find in the Michigan Road Overlay) the building should be a style that would maintain the Steak 'n Shake identity and yet reflect the Carmel community. The Department's comments in regard to signage have apparently been addressed, but the Department would like to see some specifics in writing.

The issue with access appears to have been addressed as presented by the petitioner. This is designed purposefully not to create ingress/egress onto Gray Road and 96th Street. If an access cut from Gray Road is granted by the BPW, the petitioner will return to the Plan Commission. The parcel to the north will not remain as greenspace—it will be developed at some future date.

Jon further commented that the petitioner is aware of the sign situation. The sign on the west façade is additional and a variance would be required from the BZA. If Plan Commission approval is granted for the sign on the west elevation, the petitioner will eliminate the wall sign on the east elevation.

A complete landscape plan along Gray Road was previously approved with the CarMax development. There will be no outdoor seating.

Mark Rattermann wanted to go on record as being thoroughly against the proposal. However, the situation should have been addressed at the platting stage and unfortunately, that time has passed.

Mark Rattermann made formal motion to **recommend approval** to the full Commission of **Docket No. 04040040 DP/ADLS, CarMax, Lot 2, Steak 'n Shake**, seconded by Steve Stromquist and Approved 4-0.

7. Docket No. 04060008 ADLS Amend: The Fountains

The applicant seeks approval for a facade renovation. The site is located at 502 E Carmel Dr. The site is zoned B-8/Business.

Filed by April Hensley of Leech-Hensley Architects, Inc.

April Hensley of Leech-Hensley Architects, Inc., 7785 East 126th Street, Fishers appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. John Tehrick, head of construction for Marsh Supermarkets was also in attendance.

The petitioner is proposing a façade remodel; a new structure would be placed over the existing glass storefront. The structure would have a “Tuscan” feel, decorative cornices, tile, and banding at the top and middle. The fountains will be re-located. A portico will be created as well as a vestibule that will allow an “air-lock” before entering the center. The portico will project at the front and the parking will be re-worked to allow for a drop-off point.

There will be a landscaping area that will incorporate a decorative Fountain.

Department Report, Jon Dobosiewicz. The signage has now been addressed—the existing ground sign has been removed. The Department would like to see the petitioner address the entire south façade of the building. The side elements do not integrate structurally into the building and this needs to be addressed.

The proposed site plan amendment needs to be rendered by a professional engineer and presented to the TAC committee for review. Curbing and landscaping are required within the parking islands. There are no other issues, except that those building that are highly visible need some type of improvement or “face lift.”

Mark Rattermann commented that this facility is a great use for an old building and he was very much in favor.

The petitioner will incorporate the side elements and give the building a “base.” The balconies are faux and not functional.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04060008 ADLS Amend, The Fountains**, seconded by Wayne Haney and APPROVED 4-0.

**8. Docket No. 04060014 ADLS Amend:
Park Northwestern, Lot 14 - All Tune and Lube**

The applicant seeks approval for wall sign. The site is located southwest of Northwestern Drive and Michigan Road. The site is zoned I-1/Industrial within the US 421 Overlay.

Filed by Tim Dusek for All Tune and Lube.

Tim Dusek appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Mr. Dusek reported that the banners are down; the changeable copy “box sign” belongs to Gas America—All Tune and

Lube shares the building. The Gas America representative said the box sign will come down when All Tune and Lube signage is approved.

The petitioner is requesting a wall sign—40 square feet allowed—the proposed sign is 38 square feet. The sign is black return, black trim, yellow face, opaque.

Department Comments, Jon Dobosiewicz. The Department recommends approval of channel letters. This building was constructed prior to the 421 Overlay. The Department recommends approval after comments and concerns have been addressed.

Mark Rattermann strongly suggested that the word “and” be made smaller in the signage, and also a space added between the words Tune/and and between and/Lube. The petitioner was agreeable to making this change and will utilize channel letters.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04060014 ADLS Amend, Park Northwestern, Lot 14, All Tune and Lube**, with specifications as noted, seconded by Steve Stromquist and **APPROVED** 4-0.

- 9. Docket No. 04060017 ADLS Amend: Hamilton Crossing West, Bldg 3-**
The applicant seeks approval for wall sign. The site is located at 12800 N Meridian Street. The site is zoned B-2/Business within the US 31 Overlay.
Filed by Steve Granner of Bose McKinney & Evans LLP for Duke Realty Limited Partnership.

Steve Granner, Bose McKinney & Evans, Tim Hall, Duke Realty, and Cindy Hughes, FCCI appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Informational booklets on this proposal were distributed earlier. A sign is requested for the south side of Building #3—there are two existing signs on the east façade towards US 31—Blue and Co. and Krieg, DeVault. The building was purchased by FCCI, and their sign is on the east façade. The FCCI sign on the east façade is requested for duplication on the south façade.

Initially, the petitioner thought they had three frontages; however, Mike Hollibaugh did not agree. The sign is the same dimensions as previously approved and is within the ordinance.

The Department is requesting a modification to the acrylic face to reduce the illumination on the sign. The Dept. would like for the applicant to petition the Board of Zoning Appeals for the additional, third sign; the Department would recommend approval to the Board. At this time, the current recommendation is for approval, with the exception of modifying the acrylic face.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of the design of the wall sign only, **Docket No. 04060017 ADLS Amend, Hamilton Crossing West, Bldg. 3**; approval is not to be construed as approval for the third additional sign, seconded by Steve Stromquist, **APPROVED** 4-0.

- 10. Docket No. 04060024 ADLS Amend: Merchants' Pointe, Lot 6**

The applicant seeks approval for wall and ground signs. The site is located at 2325 Pointe Parkway. The site is zoned B-8/Business.
Filed by Gary Linder of The Linder Company.

Gary Linder, The Linder Company, and Barbara Eden of Carson Design Associates appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Approval is requested for a wall sign and a ground sign.

The signs are self-illuminating, white face, dark bronze return. Carson Design is the 2nd floor tenant; the sign would display the street number and the Linder Company name. Carson would be internally illuminated to the same level as the retail building next door. Originally there were four tenants—currently there are three tenants.

There are no plans for signage on the west elevation of the building.

Department Report, Jon Dobosiewicz. The Department recommends approval after all concerns have been addressed.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04060024 ADLS Amend, Merchants' Pointe, Lot 6**, seconded by Wayne Haney, **APPROVED 4-0**.

Side Note: Jon Dobosiewicz asked if Gary Linder would be willing to help bring the O'Charley's ground sign more in conformance with the center's signage—Gary Linder said he would send a letter to O'Charley's and bring it to their attention.

- 11. Docket No. 04060025 ADLS Amend: Fidelity Plaza, Tower 3, Fifth Third Bank**
The applicant seeks approval for a bank canopy addition and other site improvements. The site is located at 11590 N Meridian St. The site is zoned S-2/Residence & B-6/Business within the US 31 Overlay.
Filed by Scott Bordenet of Benchmark Land Services for REI Investments.

Scott Bordenet of Benchmark Land Service appeared before the Committee representing the applicant. Also in attendance, David Curle and Tom Pryor of K4 architecture, 700 West Pete Rose Way, Suite 360, Cincinnati, Ohio.

The applicant is requesting approval for the construction of a canopy for a drive thru facility with 5 new lanes and parking lot improvements. Currently there is no drive through facility at this location.

In response to the Department Report, certain aesthetic changes have been made. The canopy color will match the brick in the building; the signage now complies with the Ordinance, and the size of the sign in the vestibule has been reduced to less than three (3) square feet. The building will blend with the existing architecture and the color of the EFIS. Eight (8) parking spaces have been eliminated next to the drive through facility and landscaping has been added.

A wall sign is proposed on the northeast elevation and the Department is amenable to that location. The sign is white face, bronze aluminum single letters, backlit. The sign will match the Midwest Eye Institute and Union Planters Bank.

Jon Dobosiewicz reported that the petitioner is on the Technical Advisory Committee Agenda for July 21, 2004 review. The brick enclosure for the "Genie ATM" machine is to match the brick building.

Mark Rattermann moved for approval of **Docket No. 04060025 ADLS Amend, Fidelity Plaza, Tower 3, Fifth Third Bank as amended**, seconded by Wayne Haney, **APPROVED 4-0**.

There being no further business to come before the Committee, the meeting was adjourned at 9:20 PM.

Jerry Chomanczuk, Chairperson

Ramona Hancock, Secretary